

Proposals by Two Sides Compared

2-1-72
NYT

Special to The New York Times

WASHINGTON, Jan. 31—Following is a comparison of the nine-point peace proposal made public by the North Viet namese delegation in Paris today and the eight-point plan of the Governments of the United States and South Vietnam revealed by President Nixon on Jan. 25:

Troop Withdrawal

North Vietnam plan: The withdrawal of "the totality" of all United States and allied foreign forces from South Vietnam and other Indochinese countries should be completed within 1971. (The plan was first proposed privately June 26, 1971.)

United States plan: The total withdrawal of all United States and allied foreign forces from South Vietnam alone within six months of an agreement.

Prisoner Release

North Vietnam plan: The release of all military men and civilians captured in the war carried out "parallelly and completed at the same time" as the troop withdrawals.

United States plan: The release of all military men and "innocent" civilians carried out in parallel with the troop withdrawals. Both sides to present a complete list of military men and civilians held throughout Indochina on the day an agreement is signed. Release to begin on the same day as the troop withdrawals and to be completed when they are completed.

Political Future of South Vietnam

North Vietnam plan: The United States should stop supporting the present government in Saigon so that there may be set up in its place a new administration standing for "peace, independence, neutrality and democracy." Negotiations between the provisional revolutionary government, or Vietcong, and the new administration to settle "all internal affairs of South Vietnam."

United States plan: A free, democratic presidential election within six months of the agreement, organized and run by an independent body representing all political forces in South Vietnam. The body will determine the qualification of candidates. There shall be international supervision of the election.

The incumbent President and Vice President of South Vietnam will resign a month before the election. The United States will remain neutral, support no candidate, will abide by the outcome and "is prepared to define its military and economic assistance relationship with any government that exists in South Vietnam."

South Vietnam, along with the other countries of Indochina, should adopt a foreign policy consistent with the military provisions of the 1954 Geneva accords. Reunification of Vietnam to be negotiated between North and South without annexation by either party or outside interference.

Reparations

North Vietnamese plan: The United States Government must bear full responsibility for, and pay reparations for, the damage caused by the United States to the whole of Vietnam.

United States plan: No specific mention of damage, but the President, the White House has said, offered to finance a \$7.5-billion reconstruction program in Indochina of which the North Vietnamese share would be \$2.5-billion.

Indochina

North Vietnamese plan: The United States should respect the 1954 Geneva agreements on Indochina and those of 1962 on Laos. The United States should stop its aggression in Indochina and let the Indochinese people settle their own affairs by themselves.

United States plan: "Both sides" should respect the Geneva agreements of 1954 and 1962. There will be "no foreign intervention" in those countries.

Resolution of Indochinese Problems

North Vietnam plan: The problems among the Indochinese countries should be settled by those countries "on the basis of mutual respect for independence, sovereignty, and territorial integrity and noninterference in each other's internal affairs." North Vietnam "is prepared to join" in resolving such problems.

United States plan: The same language is used, with the following addition: "Among the problems that will be settled is the implementation of the principle that all armed forces of the countries of Indochina must remain within their national frontiers."

Cease-Fire

North Vietnam plan: All the parties should achieve a cease-fire "after the signing of the agreements on the above-mentioned problems."

United States plan: A general cease-fire to begin when the agreement is signed. As part of the cease-fire, there will be "no further infiltration of outside forces into any of the countries of Indochina."

International Supervision

North Vietnam plan: "There should be an international supervision."

United States plan: International supervision of the military aspects of the agreement, including the cease-fire, the release of prisoners of war, withdrawal of outside forces from Indochina and the implementation of the principle that all armed forces of the countries of Indochina must remain within their national frontiers.

International Guarantee

North Vietnam plan: An international guarantee for the "fundamental rights of the Indochinese peoples, the neutrality of South Vietnam, Laos and Cambodia and lasting peace in this region."

United States plan: An international guarantee for the "fundamental rights of the Indochinese peoples, the status of all the countries of Indochina and lasting peace in this region."

Other differences: In addition to those inherent in the text of the plans, such as the timing of withdrawal and provisions of the cease-fire, the two sides have argued during the negotiations over the definition of "withdrawal" and the political future of South Vietnam.

On withdrawal, the North Vietnamese have insisted, according to the Presidential adviser on national security, Henry A. Kissinger, that it must include the removal of all American equipment and the cessation of

all economic and military aid to the South Vietnamese Government.

They also, according to Mr. Kissinger, have demanded that the United States set a date for total withdrawal and implement it, regardless of subsequent developments on prisoner release, and other issues.

On the political future of South Vietnam, Mr. Kissinger says that the North Vietnamese have demanded that the United States bring about, directly or indirectly, the overthrow of the present Government.