

**SPECIAL**

# skeptic

ONE DOLLAR

THE FORUM FOR CONTEMPORARY HISTORY

NO. 49

CDC 0084

May-June  
1974

What you should know about

# IMPEACHMENT

Should  
the President  
Be Impeached?

Understanding  
Impeachment

What Impeachment  
Could Mean  
for America



Featuring:

Eugene J. McCarthy  
Alexander Hamilton  
I. F. Stone

William F. Buckley, Jr.  
Raoul Berger  
Clare Boothe Luce

George McGovern  
George F. Will  
Lowell Ponte

# What is Right?

Soon after he had cast the decisive vote to acquit President Andrew Johnson, Senator Edmund G. Ross (R-Kansas) said, "I almost literally looked down into my open grave. Friendships, position, fortune, everything that makes life desirable . . . were about to be swept away by the breath of my mouth . . ." Ross was prophetic. None of the Republican senators who had voted for acquittal of the President were ever again elected to national office.

We'd prefer not to speculate on whether history will repeat itself. But in the weeks ahead, around 535 elected representatives may suffer similar waking nightmares.

Indeed, every thinking American is likely to experience some degree of psychic malaise, because the future of our country hangs in the balance. The course of history will be influenced by our answer to the central question: Should the President be impeached? And then: If so, should he be convicted and removed from office?

Constitutional scholars are looking for the answer in the Constitution and *The*

*Federalist Papers*; historians, in English and American history; lawyers, in the law and legal precedent; politicians, in the polls and their constituencies. The answer probably lies in all of those places and in none of them.

For impeachment, finally, is a moral issue. What most Americans need desperately to know is not what history tells us to do, not what will help the Republicans or Democrats, not even what is good for Richard Nixon, but *what is right*: What is right, in purely moral terms; what is right for the America we bequeath to our children.

SKEPTIC cannot tell you what is right; that is between you and your conscience. What we can do is what we've done in this issue — provide you with information that can help you answer "Should he be impeached?" Included here are opinions and arguments on both sides; interpretations; historical background. Some of the articles are original; some are from other publications. Some are among the most perceptive writing done on impeachment; some merely represent points of view that ought to be represented.



---

*SKEPTIC is the journal of the Forum for Contemporary History, a non-political, non-partisan organization formed to provide opportunities for the free expression of controversial and divergent points of view. It grew out of a series of debates-in-print about significant issues. Each debate was initiated by a "Forum Letter" from an individual who, in some way, had made or influenced contemporary history. In turn, qualified spokesmen and Forum members would rebut or comment upon the letter.*

*Although the format has changed, the spirit of debate, of challenge, of questioning remains. Each issue of SKEPTIC will be devoted to a topic of current interest and concern. A bound-in Forum Letter (in this issue, from Eugene McCarthy) will set forth or define the subject, or offer a provocative point of departure for discussion. SKEPTIC will include responses to the Forum Letter and other material (original or from other publications) which further illumines the subject.*

*SKEPTIC exists to help clarify the most important issues, problems and controversies of our time . . . to help readers understand the pros and cons, organize their thinking and develop their own opinions.*

PRESIDENT-PUBLISHER  
James L. Bartlett, III

EDITOR  
Henry B. Burnett, Jr.

MANAGING EDITOR  
Christiane Schlumberger

ASSOCIATE EDITORS  
Robert Haydon Jones, Jr.  
Patricia Loud

CONTRIBUTING EDITORS  
Christopher H. Bone  
Roy L. Erikson, Jr.  
Lowell Ponte

RESEARCHERS  
Bob Garcia  
Michael Roesch  
Jody Simms

EDITORIAL CHAIRMAN  
Edward Engberg

DESIGN  
Scott F. Reid & Associates

FINANCIAL CONSULTANT  
Eugene F. Zannon  
Anacapa Fund

CIRCULATION  
Media Selection Corp.  
350 South Kellogg  
Goleta, California 93017  
(805) 964-3561

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Ron Beaton  
Bobbe's Typing Service  
Roger Boos  
Capital Distributing Company  
The Composition House  
William B. Dickinson, Jr.  
Maurice Duca  
Robert Duggan  
Ellen Geiger  
Jim Gregory  
Felicity Harley  
Harper's Magazine  
Interweb  
Gretchen Knapp  
Mark Laney  
Los Angeles Times  
National Broadcasting Company  
Marty Neumeier  
New York Magazine  
The New York Review of Books  
The New York Times  
Richard Parker  
Ron Raffaelli  
Santa Barbara Photo Engraving  
Christopher Stagg  
Bonni Wallace  
The Washington Post  
Who's Who in America  
Patty Yancey

WHAT IS RIGHT? / Henry B. Burnett, Jr. inside front cover

**SHOULD THE PRESIDENT BE IMPEACHED?** *A scattering of pros and cons from qualified leaders and commentators . . . a broad range of viewpoints and arguments on the central question, against which to compare, develop and sharpen your own opinions.* 4

**The Forum Letter** / Eugene J. McCarthy 5

**Dispel the Dark Clouds** / Senator George McGovern 9

**A Perversion of the Constitution** / Ernest van den Haag 11

**A Sufficient Body of Evidence** / Charles L. Mee, Jr. 13

**Hamlet in Congress: A Soliloquy** / Clare Boothe Luce 14

**Exorcism Down in the Rat Maze** / Lowell Ponte 15

**Selected Quotes and Comments** 18

**Impeachment** / I. F. Stone, from *The New York Review of Books* 20

**A Bill of Impeachment** / from *The Progressive* 25

**Impeachment: A Conversation Between William F. Buckley, Jr. and John Kenneth Galbraith** / from NBC-TV 26

**Memo to a Congressman: The Argument for Impeachment** / Richard Reeves, from *New York Magazine* 28

**UNDERSTANDING IMPEACHMENT** *What does the Constitution mean? How is it to be interpreted? What "other high crimes and misdemeanors" did the framers have in mind? The arguments about what constitutes "impeachable offenses."* 30

**The Federalist, Number 65** / Alexander Hamilton 31

**Impeachment: The Constitutional Problems** / Raoul Berger, from *Harper's* 34

**No Doubtful Authority Ought to Be Exercised** / William W. Van Alstyne, from *Los Angeles Times* 39

**Loose Talk About Strict Construction** / George F. Will, from *The New York Times* 42

**THE HISTORY OF IMPEACHMENT** *The Constitution does not define impeachable offenses precisely, but much can be gained from a reading of history.* 44

**Due Process for the President: The History and The Issues** / Gaddis Smith, from *The New York Times Magazine* 45

**WHAT IMPEACHMENT COULD MEAN FOR AMERICA** *What happens if the President is impeached, but not convicted? If he is convicted? A look ahead into the unknown, where "there be dragons."* 55

**Impeachment: Make the Most of It** / Edward Engberg 51

**SKEPTIC SURVEY** / Should the President be Impeached? 53

**READING GUIDE** / Roy L. Erikson, Jr. 54

**SKEPTICAL EYE** 65

**THE FORUM** 66

*Skeptic* is published bimonthly, \$6 per year, by Forum for Contemporary History, Inc., 812 Anacapa Street, Santa Barbara, California 93101. Second-class postage is paid at Santa Barbara, California. Issue No. 49 May/June 1974. © 1974 Forum for Contemporary History, Inc. All rights reserved.