

Letter to the Editor



George Costello's excellent review of Gerald Posner's *Case Closed* (41 FED. BAR NEWS & J. 233 (Mar./Apr. 1994)) brought to mind unsettling experiences I've had exploring Posner's work. Posner mentioned, in support of his contention that James Tague was hit by a fragment from the first of three shots, that Tague reported in a 1992 interview that he did not know which of the three shots hit him.¹ As recently noted by Harold Weisberg in his new book, *Case Open*,² however, Tague told the Warren Commission that he was *not* hit by a fragment from the first shot. I called Tague on April 30, 1994, and he told me the same thing he told the Warren Commission. Thus, Tague not only flatly contradicts Posner's reconstruction of the shooting, he reveals that Posner misrepresented Tague's views, which have been consistent over three decades. Moreover, Tague also told me that he has never spoken with Posner, though the implication of three references in *Case Closed* is that Posner did speak with him on two successive days.³

Posner dismissed Rose Cheramie's remarkable clairvoyance that President Kennedy was to be killed in Dallas by claiming that the witness to Cheramie's statements, Dr. Victor Weiss, reported that Cheramie only mentioned this after Oswald's death. This is flatly untrue, which Posner must know from the work of the 1978 House Select Committee on Assassinations (HSCA) which reported that, according to Dr. Weiss, "Dr. Bowers allegedly told Weiss that the patient, Rose Cheramie, had stated *before the assassination* that President Kennedy was going to be killed. . . ."⁴ Moreover, Posner certainly knowingly neglected to mention another unassailable, HSCA-cited witness, Louisiana state

police lieutenant Francis Fruge. He reported Cheramie made the prediction directly to him two days before Kennedy's murder.⁵

Posner cited the testimony of Renatus Hartogs, the psychiatrist who examined Oswald as a teenage truant, arguing that Hartogs' findings suggested a violent potential.⁴ The Warren Commission dismissed Hartogs' testimony when an examination of his original report revealed the opposite conclusion. In fact, the commission concluded, "[c]ontrary to reports that appeared after the assassination, the psychiatric examination did not indicate that Lee Oswald was a potential assassin, potentially dangerous, that his 'outlook on life had strongly paranoid overtones,' or that he should be institutionalized."⁷

On November 17, 1993, before the House Committee on Government Operations, Posner reported that he had interviewed two of Kennedy's pathologists, James Humes, M.D., and J. Thornton Boswell, M.D.⁸ Posner testified that they confirmed to him that they had changed their minds about the original location they had given for Kennedy's skull wound. In their 1963 autopsy report,⁹ and again in 1992 interviews published in the *Journal of American Medical Association* (JAMA), both pathologists claimed the bullet entered Kennedy's skull "to the right and just above" the base of the rear of the skull, near the external occipital protuberance.¹⁰ Posner informed the U.S. Congress that the pathologists told him that they had erred—the wound was 10 centimeters higher, at the top rear of the skull. On March 30, 1994, I called both Drs. Humes and Boswell. Both physicians told me that they had not changed their minds about Kennedy's wounds at all. They stood by their statements in JAMA, which contradict Posner.

Startlingly, Dr. Boswell told me that he has never spoken with Posner.

While one is naturally loath to question the good faith of any author, especially one nominated for the Pulitzer Prize, Posner seems to be begging even Warren Commission loyalists to question his. □

Gary L. Aguilar, M.D.
San Francisco, California

Chairman, Department of Surgery,
Saint Francis Memorial Hospital, San Francisco
Assistant Professor of Ophthalmology,
Stanford University Medical Center
Assistant Professor of Ophthalmology,
University of California, San Francisco
Member, Board of Directors,
San Francisco County Medical Society
Member, American Medical Association
Member, California Medical Association

ENDNOTES

¹GERALD POSNER, *CASE CLOSED* 325 (1993)

²HAROLD WEISBERG, *CASE OPEN* 159 (1994)

³POSNER, *supra* note 1, at 553 nn.31-33.

⁴REPORT OF THE HOUSE SELECT COMMITTEE ON ASSASSINATIONS, V.10 at 200-201 (1978) (emphasis added).

⁵*Id.* at 201-202.

⁶POSNER, *supra* note 1, at 12-13.

⁷U.S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE, REPORT OF THE PRESIDENT'S COMMISSION ON THE ASSASSINATION OF PRESIDENT JOHN F. KENNEDY 379 (1964) [hereinafter WARREN REPORT].

⁸U.S. GOVERNMENT PRINTING OFFICE, HEARING BEFORE THE LEGISLATION AND NATIONAL SECURITY SUBCOMMITTEE OF THE COMMITTEE ON GOVERNMENT OPERATIONS, HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES, ONE HUNDRED THIRD CONGRESS, FIRST SESSION, NOVEMBER 17, 1993, 112-13 (1994).

⁹WARREN REPORT, *supra* note 7; HEARING, *id.* at 110.

¹⁰D.L. Breo, *JFK's Death: The Plain Truth from the MD's Who Did the Autopsy*, 267 JAMA 2797 (1992).

Larry Gollub
 Maria I. Gonzalez
 Robert E. Gordon
 Charles B. Gorham
 Mark S. Granger
 Robert A. Grantham
 George E. Green
 Ronald M. Greenberg
 Rogelio Guzman-Lloveras
 Kelly D. Hancock
 Richard N. Haskell
 Norman D. Hawkins
 Neil Heikkila
 Peter G. Herman
 Robert T. Higginbotham, Jr.
 Cloud H. Hiller, III
 Kent Hofmeister
 Patricia L. Ingram
 Ronald G. Isaac
 Michael Jablonski
 Robert M. Jeffers
 Ronald A. Johnson
 Chief Judge William Johnson
 Andrea J. Kaufman
 John P. Kelley
 Patricia D. Kenny
 Andrew Kever
 Matthew E. Kiely
 William B. Kingman
 Robert A. Kosseff
 Robert M. Krasne
 Curtis C. Kronlage
 David Kuckelman
 Lloyd G. Larkin
 Mark A. Latterman
 Beverly E. Ledbetter
 Jeannine Lee

Hon. Mary Ann V. Lemmon
 D. Brent Lemon
 Charles B. Lennahan
 Hugh M. Leonard
 Emery J. Leuchtag
 Alan F. Levin
 Andrew D. Levy
 Lisa J. Lieber
 Miguel Limeres-Grau
 Francis J. Lobrano
 Robert D. Lowry
 Myrna I. Lozada Guzman
 William M. Lukens
 Richard M. Lustig
 Robert D. Maack
 Eric N. Macey
 Alan N. Magenheimer
 Capt. Stephen S. Malley
 Kenneth L. Mann
 Shirley S. Massey
 George W. Mayo, Jr.
 Don R. McAdams, Jr.
 Joseph A. McCormick, Jr.
 Stephan L. McDavid
 Dana E. McDonald
 William P. McKeithan
 William F. McKenna
 Barbara McLennan
 David S. McLeod
 Robert A. McNew
 Dennis Menke
 Gregory V. Mersol
 Lloyd B. Miller
 Antonio J. Miranda
 Darryl Mounger
 Michael R. Mueller
 Tom Mugavero

Pierre Murphy
 Jeffrey R. Nickerson
 Rex Niswander
 Philip J. Norgaard
 Deborah J. Notkin
 Joseph M. Orlando
 Capt. Eugenio Otero-Silva
 Bruce A. Owdom
 Alan P. Owens
 Thomas W. Pahl
 Phaedra R. Pansegrau
 Alice A. Pare-Johnson
 Fernando Perez, III
 Eric Perez-Ochoa
 Mark L. Pettinari
 Rose Pothier
 William C. Purdy
 Robert D. Rapp
 Boyd H. Ratchye
 Donald M. Re
 Mary L. Readey
 Dennis J. Rehak
 Fred B. Rhodes, Jr.
 Ward D. Richards
 Dana E. Riddet
 James C. Roberts
 Ricardo L. Rodriguez Padilla
 Paul W. Rogosheske
 Robert A. Rohrbaugh
 Frank E. Ronzio
 Louis T. Rosenberg
 Charles L. Ruffin
 John D. Rutland
 Richard T. Sampson
 Glenda Sanders
 James L. Santelle
 Thomas B. Schmidt, III

Donna L. Schnorr
 Thomas E. Schwab
 Christopher E. Seymour
 Tom Shipp
 Miriam L. Siefer
 Jose T. Silva Cuetara
 Elise Singer
 Frances J. Skinner-Lewis
 Brian W. Smith
 Paul Alan Smith
 Harry Spar
 Thomas R. Spencer, Jr.
 William E. Stockman
 Hon. William Strasser
 Roger M. Synenberg
 Fel Tabangay
 Robert I. Targ
 Eric J. Taube
 Richard A. Thalheim, Jr.
 Eugene E. Threadgill
 Edward D. Tolley
 William E. Trautman
 Rafael R. Vizcarrondo
 John J. Vlahos
 Ronald W. Wangerow
 William P. Weaver, Jr.
 Britton D. Weimer
 Lawrence G. Widem
 Carl B. Wilkerson
 Wesley S. Williams, Jr.
 Che Dawn Williamson
 Thomas W. Winland
 Jack F. Witcher
 Barry A. Woodbrey, Jr.
 Joanne W. Young
 Todd Young



Application for Membership in the Federal Bar Association



Return completed application to: Federal Bar Association, 1815 H Street, NW • Suite 408 • Washington, D.C. 20006-3697
 For additional information, call (202) 638-0252, Fax (202) 775-0295

Membership Eligibility: Membership is open to any person admitted to the practice of law before a federal court or a court of record in any of the several states, commonwealths, territories, or possessions of the U.S., or in the District of Columbia, provided you have been an officer or employee of the United States or the District of Columbia, you have a substantial interest or participate in the area of federal law, or you are a law student not admitted to practice.

ABA Member? Yes No

Type of Practice: Private Government Military Corporate Retired

First Bar Admission (required: list state, court, date)

Current/Former Federal Employee or Officer of (list agency)

- \$79—Senior Membership (applicant has been admitted to bar 5 years or more)
 \$40—Junior Membership (applicant has been admitted to bar fewer than 5 years)
 \$40—Retired Membership (applicant is fully retired)
 \$10—Law Student Associate (applicant is a law student not admitted to practice)
 \$50—Optional Sustaining Membership
 (in addition to regular dues for support of CLE programs and publications)

Please bill me. My check, made payable to FBA, is enclosed.

Charge my dues to: VISA MasterCard Diners Club

Can we bill your membership dues in subsequent years to this card? Yes No

Name _____

Title _____

Agency/Firm/Law School _____ Suite No. _____

Street Address _____

City _____ State _____ Zip _____

() _____ () _____

Daytime Phone _____ Fax Number _____

Date of Birth: ____/____/____ Gender: Male Female

Card No. _____ Exp. Date _____

Signature of Applicant _____